



Scottish Police Federation

5 Woodside Place Glasgow G3 7QF

IPCRA Conference Copenhagen

June 2011

Comparison of Police Wages to other Groups in Society

Background

It is important delegates understand the significance of the following when considering the subject of police pay and that of other sectors from a Scottish context.

The Union of the Crowns in 1603 (which saw Scotland & England ruled by the same King) was followed in 1703 by the Act of Union. Although this resulted in the ceding of legislative control to Westminster, the application of any legislation to Scotland always demanded specific ratification from the Secretary of State for Scotland. In truth this was often little more than a paper exercise as the Secretary of State for Scotland was always part of the wider UK Government and would routinely follow the government position. Despite this close political linkage between the countries, Scotland's legal system remained fiercely independent.

The Police Negotiating Board (PNB) was formed in 1979 following a wholesale enquiry into police working arrangements, pensions, pay and conditions of service. This saw the birth of a Staff Side and an Official side, which as their names suggest became responsible for the negotiations of police pay ever since from the respective positions of 'employee' and 'employer'.

The Scottish Police Federation (SPF), the Police Federation for Northern Ireland (PFNI) and the Police Federation for England & Wales (PFEW) engaging in national collective bargaining on the issue of police pay as part of the Staff Side.

Where negotiations result in agreement, these agreements in their own right demand the specific ratification of the respective Secretaries of State for Scotland, Northern Ireland and England & Wales before they attain legislative security. Similar to the wider legislative provisions of the UK, these arrangements in their own right have largely been paper exercises given the certainty the respective Secretaries of State were from the same Government.

The Scotland Act of 1998 which provided for the reformation of a Scottish Parliament was followed in 1999 by the opening of that parliament. Whilst

responsibility for policing was at least on paper, a matter which always demanded the specific approval of the Secretary of State for Scotland, this legislation returned wholesale responsibility to ministers in the reformed parliament.

As was to be expected and given the importance of pan UK policing provisions, this constitutional change has next to no impact on the running of the PNB.

Indeed and in recognition of their position Scottish Government (SG) representatives are part of the Official Side of PNB and engage in UK wide negotiations on that basis. The relative harmony continued in the first two terms of the Scottish Parliament, undoubtedly in a large part due to the fact the SG was of the same political party persuasion as that in Westminster. However the Scottish elections of 2007 saw that change with the Scottish Parliament having a differing ruling political party to that in Westminster.

The significance of this, from a police pay perspective became apparent in December of that year when the Home Secretary with responsibility for policing in England Wales (and at that time Northern Ireland) refused to ratify a 3 year pay deal agreed at the PNB. Her counterpart in Scotland, the Cabinet Secretary for Justice did ratify the award and for the first time since the formulation of the PNB police officers across the UK received a different pay settlement.

Economic Background

Although Scotland has its own parliament with many powers, one significant power it does not have is over raising its own income. The political arguments for and against this arrangement are as diverse as they are bitter and vitriolic. However in simple terms Scotland receives a Block Grant of funding from the UK treasury to spend on services in Scotland in accordance with (a) the wishes of the Scottish Parliament and (b) within the revenue available.

These arrangements in their own right may have an enormous impact on police pay in Scotland in the future especially when considered against the wider economic circumstances that prevail in the UK at this time.

- Excluding banking liabilities UK borrowing are estimated to be in the region of £712 BN in the next five years. By way of comparison UK borrowing in the previous 350 years has been approximately £500 BN (including the financing of two world wars).
- The SG Budget for 2010/11 has demand £ 521+ M in efficiency savings. The SG budget does not take cognisance of UK retained responsibilities, for example state benefits. Independent examination undertaken on behalf of the SG estimates these savings amount to cuts in excess of £ 800M.

- HM Treasury predictions (generally the optimistic end of predictions) anticipate 10.6% cumulative growth for the 2011 -14 spending review period.
- Independent predictions (including the Bank of England) anticipate 7.2% cumulative growth for the same period.
- Every 1% below the HM Treasury predictions equates to a reduction from the SG Block Grant of approx £ 440 M cumulative year on year.
- HM Treasury figures in their own right suggest a 9% real terms cut to the SC Block Grant by 2013/14.
- Independent estimates place this real terms cut around 12% and SG and local authorities are working to this estimate.
- For the same period demand for services is estimated to increase by 2% per annum in real terms from 2010/11. This provides for estimated differences of between 17% and 20% in real terms by 2013/ 14 in what is coming in and what is coming out.
- The Institute for Fiscal Studies estimates that by 2017/ 18 the SG Block Grant will have suffered a real terms cut of approx 9.5%. This cut will demand reductions in the cost of a whole series of areas of expenditure in Scotland, including that of policing and in all probability police pay.

Other Considerations

- Setting aside all arguments over rurality, sparsity, oil revenues etc the Barnett Formula (the system used to determine Scotland's Block Grant) ensures Scotland receives approx 125% per capita spend to the English average. In very basic terms for every £1.00 spent in England, £1.25 is spent in Scotland.
- The Barnett Formula is in the sight of the UK coalition government for review.
- In addition a coalition of the Scottish opposition parties recommended changes to Barnett funding through the Calman Commission (commission set up by the opposition parties in the Scottish Parliament to examine increasing Scotland's capacity to become more responsible for raising a share of its own direct funding – in order to subdue calls for greater or full independence).

- If the Barnett formula was altered to ensure parity in per capita spend that would reduce the SG Block Grant by approx £1.2 BN
- The Calman Commission recommended the 'de Barnettising' of 1/3 of the SG Block Grant. If adopted this would demand an increase in Scottish taxation just to retain the status quo. This is in addition to any increase in taxation determined by the UK Government such as General Taxation, National Insurance Contributions VAT etc.
- It is highly probable Barnett will change. The House of Lords published a report last summer which recommended a reduction in Barnett funding over a seven year period.

In light of the above Scotland is facing a significant period of reduced income and reduced services. Within a fixed budget or block grant system of funding (the Scottish Government has no borrowing powers) the impact is expected to be severe.

Accordingly pay settlements across the whole sphere of public services and policing in Scotland may well face pressures different to other areas of the UK. Additionally, it is unclear exactly what benefit is gleaned from such exercises as the vastly differing conditions of employment, length of working week, annual leave arrangements and type of work undertaken can result in a great deal of effort which ultimately reveals not a lot. A particular difficulty in comparing the public to the private sector is the fact that the roles often undertaken in one do not necessarily correlate with the other. Even relatively lower-end jobs in the private sector carry greater responsibility than those in the private sector and this will impact on wages.

Given that many in the public sector have jobs which demand enormous skill it is to be expected that the proportion of the general workforce with higher wages will be greater than in the private sector. This can be down to a number of things for example (a) there are few private sector jobs equivalent to those specialist in the public sector and (b) the private sector's sheer size when compared to the public sector.

Pay settlement comparisons

At this time police officer pay in the UK (including Scotland) is as follows;

Constables	From £ 22,680 to £ 35,610
Sergeant	From £ 35,610 to £ 40,020
Inspector	From £ 45,624 to £ 49,488
Ch Inspector	From £ 50,502 to £ 52,578

All officers have the opportunity to gain access to a competency related payment once at the top of their scale. This payment is currently £1182 p/a and is pensionable. Constables and Sergeants only have access to overtime at the following rates;

Time + 1/3	Normal Overtime
Time + 1/2	Rest days with less than 15 days notice
Time x 2	Rest days with less than 5 days notice (and public holiday)

All salaries are due to increase by 2.55% in September 2010.

Firefighters July 2009			
Role	Basic salary, £pa	Basic salary, £ph¹	Overtime rate, £ph
Firefighter			
Trainee	21,157	9.66	14.49
Trainee (control)	20,099	9.18	13.77
Development	22,038	10.06	15.09
Development (control)	20,935	9.56	14.34
Competent	28,199	12.88	19.32
Competent (control)	26,790	12.23	18.35
Watch Manager			
Development	31,940	14.58	21.87
Development (control)	30,345	13.86	20.79
Competent A	32,827	14.99	22.49
Competent A (control)	31,187	14.24	21.36
Competent B	34,961	15.96	23.94
Competent B (control)	33,211	15.16	22.74
Group Manager			
Development	41,881	19.12	-
Development (control)	39,788	18.17	-
Competent A	43,138	19.70	-
Competent A (control)	40,980	18.71	-
Competent B	46,428	21.20	-
Competent B (control)	44,108	20.14	-

Prison Service in England & Wales 1st April 2009

Grade	Min, £pa	Max, £pa
Senior manager A	62,515	82,071
Senior manager B	58,165	79,661
Senior manager C	55,060	71,740
Senior manager D ¹	47,189	65,907
Manager E	31,210	45,568
Manager F	27,690	38,654
Manager G	24,235	31,822
Principal officer	31,762	33,204
Senior officer	30,708	-
prison officer	18,135	28,643
Operational support grade	15,092	18,074
"Storeman"	13,698	15,546
prison auxiliary	12,008	13,856

1. New entrants and those promoted to senior manager D will have the "required hours addition", currently worth £5,474, separated from their pay and shown as a separate allowance, as is currently the case for managers E, F and G, as recommended in the review body's 2009 report.

Teachers in Scotland 1st April 2009	
Scale point	Teachers (main grade), £pa
6	33,399
5	31,635
4	29,751
3	28,119
2	26,604
1	25,113
0 (probationer)	20,937
Spine point	Chartered Teachers, £pa
6	40,941
5	39,432
4	37,917
3	36,411
2	35,592
1	34,428

Police Staff in Scotland 1st Sept 2009

Pay Point	£ PA	Pay Point	£ PA	Pay Point	£PA
3	12,573	26	24,237	49	44,724
4	12,996	27	25,203	50	45,807
5	13,416	28	26,049	51	46,848
6	13,845	29	26,856	52	47,940
7	14,334	30	27,672	53	49,101
8	15,060	31	28,488	54	50,265
9	15,456	32	29,316	55	51,468
10	25,834	33	29,919	56	52,737
11	16,119	34	30,705	57	53,997
12	16,413	35	31,390	58	55,275
13	16,800	36	32,520	59	56,529
14	17,208	37	33,585	60	57,807
15	17,541	38	34,446	61	59,166
16	18,024	39	35,343	62	60,555
17	18,495	40	36,267	63	62,028
18	19,005	41	37,158	64	63,540
19	19,554	42	38,076	65	65,019
20	20,061	43	38,949	66	66,648
21	20,652	44	39,861	67	68,271
22	21,324	45	40,776	68	69,867
23	22,002	46	41,778	69	71,541
24	22,719	47	42,753	70	73,257
25	23,469	48	43,713	71	74,952

In addition a shift allowance is payable of £24.12 p/w is payable where 2 rotating shifts are worked on a weekly basis (exc night shift). This increases to £38.57 per week where full rotating shifts (inc night shift) is worked

Staff below Point 37 receive overtime at time + ½ on weekends and rest days and double time on Public Holidays

One area where comparisons with other sectors is worthwhile is in the area of Equal Pay. IDS (Income Data Services) has shown that across the whole of the UK, the Gender Pay gap in the police service is one of the few that has increased in the past five years.

IDS Pay in the Public Services Report 2010;

Gender Pay Gap by Occupation 5 year comparison (-ve figures in indicate gap in favour of women)			
Occupation	% Gap 2004	% Gap 2009	Change
Nurses	2.1	2.1	0
Paramedics	18.8	-1.7	-20.5
Senior Local Government officials	7.8	0.7	-7.1
Social Workers	-1.7	-3.1	-1.4
Police Officers (Constable & Sergeant)	9.2	9.4	+0.2

The Gender Pay gap is a matter which the Staff Side of PNB is considering as a matter of importance and it is anticipated this will demand the significant shortening of the current 10 point pay scale.



Calum Steele
General Secretary